



ADVANCING EDUCATION
AND ORAL HEALTH



LEADER

**Université Saint-Joseph de Beyrouth,
Faculté de Médecine Dentaire**

LEADER Site Visit Report & Recommendations 2023

CONTENTS

1. About LEADER	4
a) About The Association for Dental Education in Europe (ADEE)	4
b) About Université Saint-Joseph de Beyrouth, Faculté de Médecine Dentaire	6
2. About the FMD USJ LEADER Site visit	7
a) The ADEE Visitation Panel	8
b) The FMD USJ Panel	8
3. Introduction, context and societal engagement	10
a) Visitation Panel Analysis and Comments	10
b) Visitation Panel Recommendations	11
4. Faculty Structure and Leadership	13
a) Visitation panel analysis and comments	13
b) Visitation Panel Recommendations	14
5. Curriculum	15
a) General Curricular approach: Visitation Panel Analysis and Comments	16
b) Curriculum Structure and content: Visitation Panel Analysis and Comments	16
c) Curriculum updating: Visitation Panel Analysis and Comments	17
d) Visitation Panel Recommendations	18
6. Student assessment strategy and approach	20
a) Visitation Panel Analysis and Comments	20
b) Visitation Panel Recommendations	21
7. Research activities	22
a) Visitation Panel Analysis and Comments	22
b) Visitation Panel Recommendations	23
8. The Faculty, staff management and staffing	24
a) Analysis and comments	24
b) Recommendations	25
9. The Student Body	26
a) Analysis and comments	26
b) Recommendations	27
10. SWOT analysis and associated recommendations	28

a) Panel Perceived Strengths and Opportunities of FMD USJ	28
b) Panel Perceived Weaknesses an possible Threats of FMD USJ	29
c) Visitation Panel Recommendations	29
11. Conclusion	31

1. About LEADER

The LEADER Excellence Programme is a continuous quality improvement initiative designed by the Association for Dental Education in Europe. It provides contextually appropriate guidance on the development of meaningful quality improvement structures within participating Dental Schools.

LEADER draws on ADEE's vast experience of Dental School visits and its pan-European network experiences to bring together a coordinated approach for dental schools to optimise and integrate their quality improvement activities in a strategic manner. LEADER is complementary to existing Quality Assurance programmes that may operate regionally. The aim of LEADER is to embed the principles of previous ADEE best-practice guidance documents including; the 'Profile and competences for the graduating European dentist – update 2009'; the 'Curriculum structure, content, learning and assessment in European undergraduate dental education – update 2010'; and the 'Quality Assurance & Benchmarking – An Approach for European Dental Schools (2010)'.

ADEE is confident that LEADER provides the framework and catalyst for schools that will give life to continuous quality improvement in a manner that, if embraced, will return rewards for dental schools, dental teachers and dental students that are sustainable. At the core of LEADER is the principle of peer-reviewed self-assessment, a commitment to continuous quality improvement and a vision that sees European schools as the leading provider of quality dental education at all levels.

a) About The Association for Dental Education in Europe (ADEE)



ADVANCING EDUCATION
AND ORAL HEALTH

The Association for Dental Education in Europe (ADEE) brings together a broad-based

membership primarily across Europe and comprises of academic institutions, specialist societies and national associations concerned with the advancement and ongoing evolution of Oral Health Professionals' (OHP) Education in a harmonised pan-European format.

ADEE is committed to the advancement of the highest level of health care for all people globally through its mission statements:

- To promote the advancement and foster convergence towards high standards of OHP education.
- To promote and help to co-ordinate peer review and quality assurance in OHP education and training.
- To promote the development of assessment and examination methods.

- To promote exchange of staff, students, and programmes.
- To disseminate knowledge and understanding of education.
- To provide a European link with other bodies concerned with education, particularly OHP education.

b) About Université Saint-Joseph de Beyrouth, Faculté de Médecine Dentaire



Université Saint-Joseph de Beyrouth (USJ) is among the largest top five private Lebanese Universities. Founded in 1875 by the Compagnie de Jésus (Jesuits), it is the leading French-speaking University in Lebanon (nonetheless the English language constitutes a prerequisite for earning any degree). USJ Faculté de Médecine Dentaire has played a significant role in the country's oral health sector, producing high quality and competent dental professionals for over a century. It is a non-profit private Dental School, one of three Dental Schools in Lebanon (the others being one private and one government supported), situated in the heart of Beirut. The Dental School, attached to the French Faculty of Medicine and Pharmacy in Beirut, was created in 1920. In January 1975, it became the Faculté de Médecine Dentaire. Initially, studies at the Dental School were a three year programme and clinical space was in a ten chair environment for clinical internships. The School adopted a four-year course in October 1936, and the dental clinic underwent several extensions in 1957, 1960, 1963 and 1969 and indeed expansion and renovation continues to this day. Today the faculty offers a wide range of programmes in a number of oral health professions and upto doctoral level on some programme. Its clinics are now equipped with circa 100 dental units.

The FMD aligns with the Vision, Mission and Values of Université Saint-Joseph de Beyrouth in its Vision 2025 perspective. The mission of the FMD is to "train highly qualified dental surgeons, fully cognizant of their social and ethical responsibilities. It also contributes to the development of the profession and its influence and standing by articulating experimental and clinical research as well as actively participates in the advancement of oral health at the national level."

The FMD is also positioned as a national and regional reference with respect to the training of top-notch dentists recognized for their excellence, their professional ethics and conscience and their social involvement through the development of research, the quality of teaching and service to the community. This center of excellence stands today, just as it was in the past, at the heart of the Faculty's Mission. In addition the FMD of the USJ is the permanent seat of the Society of Arab Dental Faculties and its dean is its permanent general secretary demonstrating the Faculties strong leadership role in the region.

2. About the FMD USJ LEADER Site visit

The ADEE FMD USJ site visit was held virtually over a number of sessions using the Zoom online platform between 3rd and 5th April 2023. This was a follow up site visit with the original panel physically visiting in 2016, a follow up report submitted in 2019 and a site visit planned for that year however not delivered due to scheduling challenges. A supplementary update (annex report) was provided by FMD USJ in 2023 providing post 2019 updates not already communicated to ADEE.

This 2023 visit utilised all previous reports 2016 self-assessment, 2016 School visit panel report, the 2019 FMD USJ update and the 2023 FMD USJ update to inform the various sessions the panel would use to engage with faculty and students.

During the three day visit period sessions focused on round-table discussions with relevant stakeholder groups within the Faculty, University and wider Stakeholder pool including:

- FMD USJ Leadership team
- FMD USJ Academics
- FMD USJ Research Staff and students
- FMD USJ Undergraduate Student body
- USJ University Leadership
- Wider stakeholder representative groups

In advance of the visit, the FMD USJ provided access to video recording of the campus and facilities and post the event provided access to various documents online via a secure platform as evidence of various statements so as to enable the panel to evaluate various statements made during the interviews and discussions.

While the primary language of the visit was English, faculty were welcome to speak in French. All reports and this final report will be in English only.

a) The ADEE Visitation Panel

The following persons attended in the capacity of site visitor for ADEE at the FMD USJ site visit. Due to the nature of online visits, not all persons attended all sessions:

Name	Position	Home University
Prof Cristina Manzanares	Panel Chairperson	University of Barcelona, Spain
Prof Pal Barkvoll	Panel Member	University of Oslo, Norway
Prof Corrado Paganelli	Panel Member	University of Brescia, Italy
Prof Upen Patel	Panel Member	University of Birmingham, UK
Prof Barry Quinn	Panel Member	Liverpool University, UK
Dr Ronald Gorter	Panel Member	ACTA, The Netherlands
Prof Elene Gigineishvili	Panel Member	University of Georgia, Georgia
Mr Denis Murphy	Observation	ADEE, Ireland
Dr Jean Michel Saade	Translation as required	FMD USJ and ADEE Executive/Regional Council Member

b) The FMD USJ Panel

The following persons represented FMD USJ during the site visit. Due to the nature of online visits, not all persons attended all sessions:

Presentation by school leadership covering strategy, vision and link to society and update on key impact items since last visit. Followed by interview and discussion with panel

- Pr Nada Farhat Mchayleh, Dean of the faculty
- Pr Jihad Fakhoury, Quality assurance delegate
- Pr Joe Bassil, Pedagogical delegate, Head of the oral surgery department
- Dr Gabriel Menassa, Health dental center delegate, Head of periodontology department
- Dr Marlène Khoury Freiha, Head of pedodontics department
- Pr Ronald Younes, President of the Lebanese dental association, Delegate for the international affairs

Presentation by School on curriculum approach: Interviews and discussion with key academic staff focusing on curriculum content, approach and updating

- Pr Nada Farhat Mchayleh, Dean of the faculty
- Pr Jihad Fakhoury, Quality assurance delegate
- Dr Nahida Assaf El Khoury, Member of the quality assurance commission
- Pr Joe Bassil, Pedagogical delegate, Head of the oral surgery department
- Pr Nassim Fares, Director of the Physiology and pathophysiology research laboratory, Director of the doctoral school for Health faculties
- Pr Nadim Mokbel, Former head of the periodontology department

Presentation by School on assessment strategy and approach: Interviews and discussion with key academic staff focusing on assessment strategy and approach

- Pr Nada Farhat Mchayleh, Dean of the faculty
- Pr Jihad Fakhoury, Quality assurance delegate
- Dr Nahida Assaf El khoury, Member of the quality assurance commission
- Pr Joe Bassil, Pedagogical delegate, Head of the oral surgery department
- Dr Roula El-Hachem Wassef, Head of the endodontic department
- Dr Colette Boueiz, Member of the fixed prosthodontic department, representing categories B and C on the faculty council

**Interview and discussion with student representative discussing their experiences
All years and programs should be included in student mix**

- Mr Elias Sassine, Delegate for the 1st year student
- Mr George Noel, Delegate for the 2nd year student

- Mr Marc Fares, Delegate for the 3th year student
- Mrs Hala Akhras, Delegate for the 4th year student
- Mr Rock Hobeika, Delegate for the 5th year student
- Mrs Marita Germanos, President of the student Alumni

Interview and discussion with college or University liaison staff discussing relationship and approach

- Pr Nada Farhat Mchayleh, Dean of the faculty
- Pr Amine El Zoghby, Head of the fixed prosthodontic department, President of the Alumni at the dental medicine faculty, President of Fauchard Association – Lebanese section
- Pr Ronald Younes, President of the Lebanese dental association, Delegate for the international affairs
- Dr Emile Chrabieh, Member of the oral surgery department, ITI fellow and Middle East chairman
- Dr Camile Haddad, Member of the quality assurance commission, Delegate for the Arab faculties' affairs
- Dr Ghassan Yared, Former president of Lebanese dental association, President of the continual education at the faculty

Interview and discussion with facility and other support staff with regards to clinical and academic space usage and planning

- Pr Nada Farhat Mchayleh, Dean of the faculty
- Pr Paul Boulos, Delegate for the funding and purchases
- Dr Hani Tohmé Head of the removable prosthodontics department and Head of the new department of digital and virtual dentistry and IA
- Pr Pascale Habre, Delegate for the human resources commission
- Dr Gabriel Menassa, Delegate for the dental care center, Delegate for the quality control ISO, Head of the periodontology department
- Mrs Marie-Rose Akl Daoud, Principal administrative
- Mrs Paulette Khoury Abou Chaaya, Vice-director of the dental care center
- Mrs Nawal El Turk, Administrative responsible for all official documents for the alumni, responsible quality control ISO
- Mrs Aline Abou Jaoude Aoun, Administrative responsible for the clinic (2nd Floor)
- Mrs Hoda Ghanem Nammour, Administrative responsible for the clinic (1st Floor)

Discussion with research staff and students

- Pr Nada Farhat Mchayleh, Dean of the faculty
- Pr Joseph Bou Serhal, Head of the orthodontic department, President of the research commission, Director of Craniofacial Research Laboratory
- Dr Roula El Hachem Wassef, Head of the endodontics department, co-director of Biomaterials Unit
- Cranio-Facial Research Laboratory
- Dr Roland Kmeid, Clinical Professor in the orthodontic department
- Dr Carole Chakar, Member of the quality and research commissions, Director of the periodontology master program, Director of the oral biology division
- Pr Elie Khoury, Delegate for the publication commission
- Ms Celine Rassi, Student, Master resident in periodontology
- Ms Yasmina Aoun, Student, Master resident in orthodontics

3. Introduction, context and societal engagement

The FMD USJ provided a brief description of the national structure of Higher Education and the relative position of the FMD USJ in the national Higher Education structure. National regulations and the Quality Assurance system in place regionally and nationally were discussed and explored by the panel, as were the regulations governing Higher Education Institutions.

The Programs developed FMD USJ are clearly developed with the local community in mind and the clinical services required by the population. Strong links with the Lebanese dental society, the Society of Arab Dental Faculties, local government bodies and wider international NGO's all provide a valuable resource for networking and knowledge sharing of community need and best practice developments for FMD USJ.

The faculty is committed to delivery concepts such as Inter Professional Care and Education as well as enabling its community to achieve the World Health Organisation's Oral Health Global Strategy within the faculties practices of oral health education and care. As practical examples the FMD USJ discussed with the panel recent work of the "From 0 to 100 years" project that promotes wider awareness of Oral health and it link to general health; the "month for children oral health" awareness project; a recent program to increase Student's awareness and involvement on Oral Health Education issues and social needs; and collaborative NGO work focusing on the Armenian community.

Despite FMD USJ operating in a challenging environment both physical and financial, the faculty has continued to advance improvement of their dental curriculum and facilities for the betterment of the student and patient experience. They have also continued to take a leading role in national strategy discussion on public dental health and international collaborations.

The visitation panel noted recent partnership agreements in Bahrain, and also with international Pierre Fauchard Academy Lebanon chapter, and with the ITI international academy.

a) Visitation Panel Analysis and Comments

The panel commends the FMD USJ and its leadership team for their commitment and driver towards quality dental and oral health professional education and clinical care. The panel acknowledges the considerable financial and other challenges faced by the FMD USJ and how they continued to proactively respond so as to delivery and continue to aim to improve service delivery.

The panel particularly noted the considerable efforts made during the COVID pandemic to ensure students' were enabled to complete their studies and in particular the use of online

and hybrid learning methods quickly provided to students and the extensions to students completion timeframes also offered.

It is clear the leadership of the FMD USJ is committed and passionate with regards to what they do and what they wish to achieve. There is a clear vision that strongly features the use and integration of enabling technologies while also remaining true to the FMD USJ founding ethos and principles of its Jesuit traditions. Plans are evolving for the upgrading of clinical spaces and further academic space. A strategic planning process that involves stakeholder engagement is also in place as evident from the 2019 submission document.

The FMD USJ is clearly aware of the challenges faced by its patient population and the difficulties some experience in paying for dental treatment and have in place an update fees structure to address this. The sense of community responsibility was evident in all panel discussion be it with leadership, faculty or students.

b) Visitation Panel Recommendations

To assist the faculty and leadership with future quality assurance and accreditation endeavours the panel recommends the following that are likely to be required by any visiting panel in the coming 24 to 36 months. In making these recommendations, it is acknowledge that some of the material may already exist and was simply not have been included or observed due to the virtual nature of this visit.

- 3.1 Formalising through a memorandum of understanding or other similar documented approaches are an effective way of establishing, evolving and monitoring stakeholder collaborations that traditionally may not otherwise be formalized. By the inclusion of aims and metrics for achievement within such documents will position the FMD USJ well for demonstrating suitable evidence in future quality activities.
- 3.2 Documenting within the FMD USJ an action plan that will enable FMD USJ to collaborate with the relevant national bodies in the creation and delivery of the country response to the WHO Oral Health Global Strategy will better formalise FMD USJ relations and positions in the national context and further reinforce its position nationally and internationally.
- 3.3 Developing and delivering an inter professional education strategy and plan will provide the FMD USJ a clear approach to making IPE and IPC a reality to be experienced by students and faculty in a meaningful manner and provide impetus for change not only in educational practices but in clinical service delivery nationally in the coming years.
- 3.4 While the panel acknowledges the eagerness of staff to support their colleagues in communicating their responses, the panel felt some staff voices may not have been heard or were rushed. Thoughtful, rich answers often come more easily with question clarification and reflection particularly in multilingual and multicultural

meetings; thus, taking time for these processes to translate across languages and cultures should be encouraged. This ensures a wide voice is heard by the panel and this is a key expectation that will lead to a very positive outcome for the FMD USJ.

4. Faculty Structure and Leadership

It is evident to the Panel from the 2016, 2019 and 2023 self-assessment reports that a clear leadership and accountability structure exist within the FMD USJ. It is also clear that suggestions made in previous site visitation reports have been taken on board and reflected upon by FMD USJ and acted upon where appropriate to national context, legal and regulatory frameworks.

a) Visitation panel analysis and comments

As detailed in the 2019 FMD USJ submission document the relationship with the university and faculty structures are standardised throughout the University, as are the committee and supporting structures.

The relationship between the University, the Faculty and the role of the Dean are clearly defined and communicated in ‘Statuts de l’Université’ (as provided via link in the 2019 self-assessment update document).

The Panel very much welcomes the creation of the FMD USJ Quality Assurance Commission as also detailed in the 2019 report. The commission is responsible for guiding the Faculty’s self-assessment, prioritisation of needed quality improvements, definition, monitoring and evaluation of projects, identification of good practices and other very relevant and pertinent quality assurance and improvement activities.

The Panel also notes the strong commitment to quality by Leadership and faculty as demonstrated by multiple certification and accreditation activities such as ongoing ISO 9000 certification and more recent achievement of Accreditation, Certification and Quality Assurance Institute (ACQUIN) recognition in 2019.

The Panel also welcomes changes in the Faculty’s Statutes that facilitate the inclusion of students in the Faculty governing bodies. A student elected by the fifth-year students as an academic representative represents students in the Faculty Council without the right to vote. The fourth-year class representative represents the students in the Education Committee, and students from different years of study are consulted by several committees and commissions of the Faculty. In addition a group composed of student representatives from the 5 years of study will be consulted by the educational representative for the modifications of the curriculum for the academic year 2019–2020.

The visitation panel commend the Rectorate Development Department for organising training sessions for the faculties on leadership and emotional intelligence both of which are key development element areas for all senior faculty internationally. Faculty ongoing participation in such activities is encouraged.

b) Visitation Panel Recommendations

To assist the faculty and leadership with future quality assurance and accreditation endeavours the panel recommends the following that are likely to be required by any visiting panel in the coming 24 to 36 months. In making these recommendations, it is acknowledged that some of the material may already exist and was simply not have been included or observed due to the virtual nature of this visit.

- 4.1 Development of a summary faculty structure document including an organogram in English will assist accreditation panels' whose primary assessment language is not French. This will remove the need for unnecessary questioning by the panel.
- 4.2 The Visitation panel suggest the continued and further evolved student's participation in the decision-making of the Faculty, would be a strong asset to the Faculty in future accreditation attempts. Formally documented the student selection process for participation in these systems and having a set of evaluation criteria for its success and impact is recommended.
- 4.3 Formalising and documenting student communication methods from council decisions that enables 360 degree feedback on decisions taken is suggested as possible means of enabling the wider student body feel included in decision making.
- 4.4 Having a documented leadership strategy and plan for progression (succession planning, including academic departmental and faculty leadership) for the Faculty will demonstrate a strategic commitment to continual leadership that meets the ethos of the Faculty and University.
- 4.5 While acknowledging the clear existence of a supporting structure for the Dean, the inclusion in the self-assessment pack of a suite of documents that demonstrates the delegated functions and accountability of the various supporting structure such as the Dean's delegates, heads of divisions, committee chairs and how these are interrelated to University and other supporting structures would enable future visitation panels to more clearly understand the delegation of authority and responsibility.

5. Curriculum

This section summarises the visitation panel's review of the curriculum approach, structure and content and makes recommendations to assist the FDM USJ quality improvement agenda and future quality assurance activities.

The visitation panel sincerely thanks the FDM USJ team and in particular, Professor Joe Bassil for the presentation on curriculum made to the panel. This clearly outlined the history, evolution, approach and ongoing development of the curriculum at FDM USJ.

The presentation also highlight how the FDM USJ had taken on board curriculum suggestion since the last ADEE visitation including:

- The harmony and consistency of the number of credits as well as the student's workload have been readjusted to be in line with the ECTS standards.
- The revision of the Competency Framework of Reference of the future graduate of the FMD, taking into consideration the convergence of this reference system with the international standards and the competency profile of the "Profile and Competence of the Graduating European Dentist".

It was evident from the presentation that FDM USJ was committed to ensuring their students are equipped with skills and competence that makes them eligible for work in the international arena and as such the FDM USJ has drawn on international and regional curricula to inform and evolve the FDM USJ curriculum and approach.

The visitation panel commends the leadership and curriculum committee for their commitment and ongoing work and its application of the PDCA approach in the evolution of the curriculum within the faculty.

It is clear that learning outcomes, skills and competence are mapped and coordinated throughout the various semesters and years of the programme. Student progress follows an incremental development approach.

Four strategic objectives are in place for the curriculum:

1. Align the development of the FMD with the quality standards of the USJ and the international benchmarks in term of education research and social responsibility
2. Enhance the FMD's competitiveness and appeal in a rapidly evolving market, by introducing innovative programs and services that cater to the changing needs of students and stakeholders.
3. Obtain international accreditation as a validation of the FMD's pursuit of excellence.
4. Incorporate digital and virtual technologies, including « AI » tools and « Metaverse », into the FMD's educational programs to facilitate its continuous growth and development as a leading institution in dental medicine.

a) General Curricular approach: Visitation Panel Analysis and Comments

The FDM USJ has applied the philosophies of the Bologna Process to its curriculum since 2003 with the concepts of European Credit Transfer Systems being allotted to the programme and its modular sub components.

The “Doctor of Dental Surgery” (DDS) degree is a professional doctorate equivalent to a Masters degree level, requiring 300 credits taking 10 semesters to complete.

Each UE (course unit) of study is assigned to a number of credits between 1 and 3.

For theoretical courses, one credit is equivalent to 25 hours of work, including 10-12 hours of face-to-face instruction and 13 to 15 hours of personal study.

For practical and clinical courses, there are 25 hours of all face-to-face contact.

Credits are divided into mandatory and optional credits offering students some degree of selection and ownership over their development and curriculum choice.

At the Macro Level a competency framework is elaborated for each program defining the student's exit profile and expected skill/competence level.

b) Curriculum Structure and content: Visitation Panel Analysis and Comments

As there is currently no regulator in place in Lebanon to carry out the accreditation process or curriculum review FDM USJ look externally to the Lebanon for certification and accreditation of the curriculum.

The importance of having the curriculum reflect local need and cultures was stressed by the faculty in their discussions with the panel.

The FDM USJ has defined eight-core competency domains specific to the FDM USJ context and culture.

- **Competency I specific to the FMD:** Mobilize the achievements of basic medical and technological sciences for their application in the medical and dental practice.
- **Competency II specific to the FMD:** Plan oral treatment based on diagnosis and prognosis, taking into account the psychological and socio-economic conditions of the patient.
- **Competency III specific to the FMD:** To take care of the preventive and curative dental care adapted to the needs and specificities of the patient.
- **Competency IV specific to the FMD:** Communicate effectively with all stakeholders in relation to the needs of the dental profession.
- **Competency V specific to the FMD:** Manage a dental office in respect of the health care team, ergonomic standards, safety and asepsis recommended by the international health authorities.

- **Competency VI specific to the FMD:** Practice the profession of dentist within the rules of ethics, professional deontology and in compliance with the contract of care.
- **Competency VII specific to the FMD:** Self-manage professional development as a dentist.
- **Competency VIII specific to the FMD:** Participate in the improvement of oral public health in accordance with national and international health policies.

At the Meso level the program-level learning outcomes specify the components of the competencies, including knowledge, skills and related attitudes. These learning outcomes are used to design the curriculum and then evaluate its effectiveness and the student's capabilities.

At the Micro level the learning outcomes at the level of the various learning modules contribute to the development of program-level learning outcomes so as to create a more cohesive and integrated approach to student learning. The plans for the learning modules specify the expected learning outcomes as well as the teaching methods that will enable them to be delivered and their assessment methods and modes.

The importance of communication and softer people skills are integrated throughout the curriculum as students move through observation to clinical practice over the semesters.

FDM USJ also integrate concepts on public health, ethical practices and behaviours and inter professional practice throughout the various semesters. In addition to what would be considered standard curricular activities and topics such as restorative dentistry, endodontics, oral pathology, bio chemistry, oral biology, anatomy etc, the curriculum also offers regional specific contents such as:

- La société libanaise : famille, partis politiques et communautés religieuses
- Histoire économique et sociale : XIXème-XXème siècles
- Législation sur la pratique de la médecine dentaire au Liban

c) Curriculum updating: Visitation Panel Analysis and Comments

The discussions with faculty demonstrated there is a formal process in place for curriculum review following a three-year cycle. This involves a review of international guidance, best practice and published curricula. It also includes local, contextual and regional best practice considerations. It also includes analysis of the student feedback and evolving trends.

The review process follows the Plan Do Study Act cycle in all updating with the curriculum committee playing a central role.

The most recent review (2019–2022) of the curriculum has led to Curriculum 23 which includes a number of key changes and evolution to the programme contents to align with changing best practices and the integration of technologies. In particular, these include;

- Introducing new courses on technologies (including Digital dentistry and AI)
- Creation of a new digital department within the Faculty
- Reactivation of the laser unit within the Faculty
- Initiating new courses on Innovation

Other areas of change include:

- Gradually Restructuring the Research courses from the first year to the fifth year
- Switching the clinical courses from a mono-disciplinary to a multi-disciplinary mode
- Introduction of multidisciplinary clinical sessions
- Establishment of international agreements with other faculties

Student focus groups have been introduced as has student feedback and evaluation on curriculum content and teaching methods.

d) Visitation Panel Recommendations

The visitation panel welcomes the willingness and commitment demonstrated to ongoing curriculum evolution within FDM USJ. The Panel feels that FDM USJ has a relevant, up to date and contextually relevant curriculum in place that is valued by its students and responsive to evolving local needs. In making the following recommendations it is acknowledge that some of the material may already exist and was simply not have been included or observed due to the virtual nature of this visit.

- 5.1 While the drive for international accreditation is laudable the visitation panel recommends that FDM USJ define and put in place a clear strategy as to what international accreditation it is seeking and to what particular market it is aiming. While core competence may be similar internationally there are fundamental differences in delivery methods and in approaches taken internationally. These differences in turn can and do influence accreditation and certification methods. Such differences if not well appreciated and managed may lead to a diluted and disjointed curriculum to evolve. Multiple accreditations may also lead to faculty being subjected to conflicting demands.
- 5.2 From our discussions with the FDM USJ team the visitation panel recommends that FDM USJ engage in bilateral agreements with either similar University or regulators to better achieve its curriculum accreditation goals. Such agreements if correctly crafted could enable FDM USJ students to practice internationally. However, these will need to be clearly focused and bounded.

5.3 Finally keeping pace with evolving curricular changes and updates can be a challenge for example ADEE's own curriculum the Graduating European Dentist is currently having a number of additions in the area of research and sustainability. We recommend that a means of integrating such concepts into the FDM USJ curriculum be considered.

6. Student assessment strategy and approach

This section summarises the discussion and findings with regards FDM USJ assessment strategy and assessment approach to student teaching and learning.

The visitation panel thanks the faculty for the presentation on assessment strategy and approach which summarised much of the contents of the self-assessment documents. The presentation highlighted how the FDM USJ has addressed and integrated the recommendations from the ADEE site visit to evolve and inform its assessment strategy and approach.

This in turn led to constructive discussion with the panel.

a) Visitation Panel Analysis and Comments

There is a comprehensive approach to assessment and evaluation throughout the programme that includes both evaluation and assessment of student competent and evaluation and assessment of teaching methods for example:

- Student exit profile aligned with the Competency Framework of References
- Programs content assessment to ensure alignment with the intended learning outcomes
- Teaching strategies, techniques, and materials assessment and evaluation to ensure they are effective in achieving the desired learning outcomes

The approach to student assessment of learning within the units is as would be expected and incorporates a mix of Formative assessment, Summative assessment, Partial and final exam and Partial and final practical exam. The FMD USJ also use OSCE's, Portfolios, Research Project Defence, Oral Presentation of Thesis.

Students are also assessed on critical analysis of a scientific article, through problem-based learning of case studies and on their conference communication skills (written, oral and poster etc). Other types of assessment focus on: use of case study; clinical evaluations of skills; oral presentation; research paper; presentation of a clinical cases and Extra-mural community work.

Assessment methods are selected to best meet the needs of the particular module while also being centrally coordinated so as to ensure an appropriate balance of assessment methods throughout the semester and years. In deciding the assessment method to be used feedback from the following is considered: Faculty council meetings; Education Committee meetings; Student's focus groups; Student's online evaluation; Teachers; Pedagogical delegate; Pedagogical commission of the University.

Success rates by assessment method and approach are monitored by the Faculty Council, as are programme completion rate, student satisfaction surveys and success rates at state examinations.

b) Visitation Panel Recommendations

It was clear to the panel that a good array of assessment strategies and methodologies are applied throughout the programme and these are used effectively and within context. The following comments are made so as to better enable future accreditation visits rather than as a critical response. In making these recommendations it is acknowledged that some of the material may already exist and was simply not have been included or observed due to the virtual nature of this visit.

- 6.1 Development of a formal suite of documents that outlines the Faculties approach, methods and quality assurance of assessment methods would be of considerable assistance as part of the self-assessment pack. This suite of documents could include overall strategy and approach, staff guidance and faculty principles and how to as well as clearly summarising the decision making process that ensure overall assessment approach.
- 6.2 Documenting staff training and development in the area of assessment and competence evaluation, how training need is evaluated, training is scheduled and staff knowledge updated would also add value to the self-assessment evidence.
- 6.3 Finally ensure the curriculum committee regularly reviews the overall assessment strategy and ensure that students are not over assessed, and that faculty and not over/under using a particular approach.
- 6.4 Technologies and artificial intelligence in particular are currently having considerable impact in student assessment. Going forward it will be critical that the faculty has a stated policy for students on the use of for example ChatGPT so there is clarity on what is acceptable and how the faculty evaluate this.

7. Research activities

As reported in the 2019 FMD USJ self-assessment document the University has reflected in its Vision 2025 document the institutional engagement in the improvement of the research at the HEI. The FMD approach has started by the development a four-year Strategic Plan to develop the research structure, as well as multidisciplinary research projects in order to improve both the student's engagement and the quality of the research developed in the School.

a) Visitation Panel Analysis and Comments

The Panel very much welcomes the creation of the FMD USJ Research Commission, with an annual strategic plan and a series of objectives also detailed in the 2019 report. The results reported are the establishment of a Database of research projects (including master's and graduate's thesis), as well as of Protocols and calendars for research projects. The Committee has developed a Training program for the research staff (in collaboration with the USJ other faculties) and has established a regular coordination with the HEI Ethical Committee. The Committee has also developed a strategy to include research in the graduate education through Student's engagement with research since the 1st year and by establishing the grade's thesis project since the 3rd year.

As a result of the interview, it was revealed that student (postgraduate) are not engaged in the Research Commission. FMD USJ Research Committee for quality improvement conducts the evaluation process of scientific activities for academic staff and lecturers, but at current time it appears to be limited financial support of scientific research activities for the academic faculty, because of the crisis in the country, this fact also was confirmed by the postgraduate students, who were interviewed in the presence of the administration.

The Panel recognises the effort made by the different research groups at the FMD USJ to facilitate graduate student's engagement in research projects and publications, as well as to start developing collaborative research and formative activities for the postgraduate students, since both initiatives have caused an increase in the number and the impact of the staff and the student's publications.

The Panel also notes the strong commitment to research quality by Leadership and faculty as demonstrated by the improvement of the laboratory equipment and staff and the development of standardised protocols and a regulated workflow for the research lab activities.

The Panel also welcomes the recent indexation in SCOPUS of the School's Research publication, the International Arab Journal of Dentistry (IJAD: <https://digitalcommons.aaru.edu.jo/iajd/>). During the interview with research staff and faculty it was discovered, that the students are encouraged to publish their scientific

activity at the IAJD Journal without charge, which is appreciated and implies as an institutional support in the student's research and scientific component.

The visitation panel commend the Rectorate for allocating funds to improve the School's research infrastructure despite the difficult situation in the country.

b) Visitation Panel Recommendations

It was clear to the panel that all the research groups develop their strategies and methodologies effectively and within context, even if the research equipment and laboratories could not be included or observed due to the virtual nature of this visit.

After reviewing the evidences provided, in order to advance in the Research Strategy of the Faculty, the Panel's considers that a comprehensive Strategic Program for Scientific and Education Research is needed to establish and develop the FDM USJ Strategic Plan for the next years by means of a cooperative effort of all departments and stakeholders.

The panel understands that the USJ provides funding to FDM researchers through a centralised process whereby research protocols are assessed and awarded funding as deemed appropriate.

This Strategy could start by

- 7.1 Incorporating young academia as well as representatives of post-graduate and graduate students to the FMD USJ Research Commission.
- 7.2 Enriching the existing list of Research Groups and Projects to constitute a strong database in order to facilitate the sharing of spaces, equipment, material and protocols to initiate collaborative inter-department research projects.
- 7.3 Encouraging Multidisciplinary research projects by means of inter-faculty, interdisciplinary or international collaborations.
- 7.4 Realization of taking part of staff and students in international events and staying at partner universities.
- 7.5 Implementing a consensus strategical planning the future FDM USJ research objectives, the actions to develop as well as the results expected and its assessment.
- 7.6 To make the evaluation procedure for faculty fairer, it is recommended that FDM USJ financially supports affiliated academic, scientific and invited teachers to begin to undertake the research;
- 7.7 Ensure that all academic staff are informed about research support from the faculty.

8. The Faculty, staff management and staffing

The Visitation Panel wishes to commend the receptive attitude of the Dean, the Faculty Senior and Junior Staff, who all offered numerous comments and suggestions during the various meetings held on the visit.

The Dean is supported by an enthusiastic team of professors, interested and eager to contribute to the academic success of the Faculty and the Students.

The various meetings between the visitation panel and faculty and administrative staff demonstrated a passion and enthusiasm within faculty for quality improvement and a clear pride in their organisation, its achievements and its students.

Our discussion also demonstrated a sense of belonging not only within the Faculty but within the wider University structure. A commitment to the vision and approach of its founding Jesuit principles was also very evident in the discussion and integrated within the practice of faculty where possible.

a) Analysis and comments

FMD USJ has 118 dental teachers, and 56 affiliate teachers, 50 residents and 33 administrative staff involved in the teaching of the programmes. The provide services to 11 PhD students, 215 postgraduate students and 328 undergraduate students.

Staff are actively involved in regional collaborations and the institution is supports the faculty in their engagement in national, regional and international activities. Staff are also encouraged to publish their work particularly in the International Arab Journal of Dentistry which is hosted by the FMD USJ.

Discussion with staff also highlighted a passion for education of their students to the highest possible standards while acknowledging and having an acute awareness of the regional and local challenges the Faculty and its students face.

Staff advised of diverse opportunities for training in-house and externally on key issues relevant to their area of practice and also in leadership skills and leadership development. Technologies and their use also play an important part of their work and there is clear enthusiasm to continue to integrate and update their use within the curriculum by FMD USJ.

As the visit was remote, the visitation panel were unable to visit staff rooms and offices to assess the available spaces and physical infrastructure being made available to staff.

Staff throughout all meetings and indeed within the various documents provided demonstrated a local contextual awareness and an expressed desire to enable a better service for its students and the wider public that it serves.

A commitment to the FMD USJ strategy and to its quality strategy was communicated with passion.

Staff are clearly engaged in national and regional activities such as with the Lebanese dental council etc. with which the Faculty has a string history of leadership.

b) Recommendations

As per the previous sections, the following recommendations are given in good faith in the spirit that they would improve future certification and accreditation visitation experience. In making these recommendations, it is acknowledge that some of the material may already exist and was simply not have been included or observed due to the virtual nature of this visit.

- 8.1 Providing the visitation panel in advance with a clear development plan of in-house and external staff training opportunities that are made available to Faculty on the development of their academic skills and all staff on their well-being and mental health would have been useful.
- 8.2 Making available to visitation panels a summary document that outlines staff progression protocols, methods and indicators would offer insight into how the Faculty enable staff progression and ensure succession planning for senior academic positions, committee chairs etc. as well as senior administrative leadership. Making this material available in summary form will help understanding of the local academic progression process in advance of visitation.
- 8.3 If the FMD USJ are interested in wider European rather than regional and USA collaboration the Panel would encourage the faculty to support staff involvement and attendance in European regional academic associations such as ADEE, ESE and similar associations with a specific focus on education and not solely a clinical or research focus.
- 8.4 The panel having seen the enthusiasm of the faculty would encourage the FMD USJ to encourage and facilitate their faculty to self-nominate for consideration of the ADEE annual educator awards and scholarships that are held annually.
- 8.5 The faculty is positioned in a unique context that has influence and impact on student and staff engagement. Thus, the panel considers that there is valuable learning opportunities that the wider academic community could benefit from. We therefore would encourage the Faculty to engage further in educational research and to publish same in the European Journal of Dental Education. Examples of such publications and areas may focus on student experiences and changing perceptions, creativity in teaching and learning strategies etc.

9. The Student Body

Finally, the focus moves to the student body and its engagement. During the visitation, the visitation panel had the opportunity to meet without faculty with student representatives from all five years of the undergraduate programme and with representatives of the research programmes.

Students at both meetings were keen to share their experiences, and demonstrated a commitment and enthusiasm for their future professions.

Of particular note to the panel was that despite the local contextual challenges these students experience on a daily basis they remain committed to their studies and passionate about their patients and wider community.

a) Analysis and comments

The students communicated well with the visitation panel discussing a wide range of topics.

The students spoke highly of their teachers and they clearly value the approach taken by faculty to ensure their progression to graduation.

The students recounted a willingness by faculty and FMD USJ to listen and seek feedback from them on a regular basis and that this feedback is acted upon by faculty.

They also shared their experience of how having a student representative on council help communicate student issues and also helps the student body better understand wider governance issues around the programme and the bounds within which faculty must operate.

The students discussed extra curricular activities they are engaged in and how accommodating and supportive of the FMD USJ are with students engagements with sports and other social programmes outside of the curriculum.

It was interesting to note that when asked if it was within their power what would they do to change the student experience all very clearly commented on the contextual and financial issues rather than programme issues. When encouraged further all that was identified by students was what would be commonly expected internationally such as more space, more time less content etc. This is a testament to how well the faculty have managed within the extreme contextual contexts they have recently faced.

b) Recommendations

As per the previous sections, the following recommendations are given in good faith in the spirit that they would improve future certification and accreditation visitation experience. In making these recommendations, it is acknowledge that some of the material may already exist and was simply not have been included or observed due to the virtual nature of this visit.

- 9.1 The visitation panel encourages the FMD USJ to continue to integrate the student voice within its governance structure throughout the various committees and commissions.

10. SWOT analysis and associated recommendations

This section summarises the perceived strengths, weakness opportunities and threats of the FMD USJ and offers some actionable recommendations for the FMD USJ to consider. As in previous sections, in making these recommendations, it is acknowledge that some of the material may already exist and was simply not have been included or observed due to the virtual nature of this visit.

a) Panel Perceived Strengths and Opportunities of FMD USJ

The following are high-level strengths of the FMD USJ as perceived by the visitation panel.

- Strong and innovative leadership within the FMD USJ supported by the ce-Deans and an enthusiastic Academic and Administrative Staff
- Dedicated staff support with a good staff-to-student ratio
- Staff are very clearly engaged with research and education in their area of expertise
- Great opportunity for clinical experience because of patient supply in challenging context
- Great opportunity for the Faculty to lead the design and management of the National Public Oral Health Services
- Great opportunity for the Faculty to lead the design and management of the National Quality Assurance agenda
- Students have the opportunity to take part in oral health community projects and are encouraged to engage in social accountability and community focused activities as part of their education
- Energetic student body, appreciative of the support from the FMD USJ
- Integrated care approach seems to be now well accepted by staff members and is spreading throughout the curriculum
- Students can access an appropriate range of materials and equipment despite the challenging financial environment
- A large and actively alumni with considerable fundraising abilities and drive provides opportunity
- An international view and perspective while also being cognisant of the national and regional needs and context is clear throughout the faculty
- Strong integration within University structure
- Strong regional presence by the institution and faculty taking the lean in many associations and activities
- A clear vision around the use and integration of technologies including the metaverse and AI
- Considerable understanding of local needs and requirements and an awareness of the need to contextualise international curricula

- A strong respect for multiculturalism, and a multi-linguistic approach grounded in the founding principles of the Jesuits philosophy

b) Panel Perceived Weaknesses and possible Threats of FMD USJ

- As is the case in many programmes there is an apparently heavy assessment load for both staff and students. Reviewing this regularly at a programme level will assist.
- Need for a standard setting process to be agreed inter-professionally to harmonize the competence's Assessment across the programme
- Limited space for development in physical context however plans are in place for a move to new premises.
- The local context financially and politically can be challenging to operations and poses a real risk. However, the leadership and faculty continue to creatively and effectively manage and respond to this for which they should be most proud.
- Multiple accreditation and certification activities can lead to faculty and staff burn out and disillusion. Having a clearly defined and focus strategy around this would be advised.
- While it may exist the panel failed to see a clearly defined and documented strategy around the FMD USJ approach to international collaborations. Documenting this will help give clarity and

c) Visitation Panel Recommendations

The panel recommends a number of key positive interventions, derived from the report and from the preceding analysis above. Whilst this list is not exhaustive, the team feels that the recommendations below will help to guide the FMD USJ in the next phase of curriculum development and in its continuing quality improvement and assurance journey.

- 10.1 Integrated curriculum design: The visitation panel recommends that the FMD USJ,
- Continue the development of the Integrated care approach
 - Increase horizontal and vertical integration for basic science and clinical teaching
 - Develop further interdisciplinary workshops based on patient cases
- 10.2 Continue to develop the integration of technologies: to facilitate
- Educational developments
 - Standard Assessment procedures
 - Patient's clinical care
 - Research projects
 - Teaching and Assessment

10.3 Streamline assessment: so as to

- a. minimise the assessment workload on students and staff
- b. continue to integrate OSCE and other assessments throughout
- c. Review the need for tests at the beginning of each clinical session
- d. incorporate student self-assessment along with teacher assessment in clinical rotations, as a preparation for lifelong learning and portfolio development

10.4 The Student-centred learning and teaching: could be further enhanced by

- a. Learning from the approach to academic delivery during covid so as to continue to embrace flexible learning and encourage students to take an active role in creating the learning process
- b. Developing further student-focused teaching methods
- c. Ensuring pedagogical methods promote a dynamic learning environment that enhances each student's learning curve
- d. Enabling staff to upskill where necessary with regards technologies and their use

11. Conclusion

During their visit, the panel had the opportunity to have an overview of the activities at FMD USJ, its leadership, its faculty and of course its student body. Based on this and earlier visits along with three supporting self assessment document and their associated documents it the opinion of the panel that the FDM USJ inion that these meet the standard of most dental schools within Europe in the vast majority of areas and in its approach to education.

The panel is astutely aware of the contextual environment within which the FMD USJ operates and its faculty and students live. We commend you all for your efforts and commitment to the betterment of dental education and to the population you and your students as future dentists will serve.

We recognise the ambition of the strategy the Faculty has selected which takes a strong stance on internationalisation and a commitment to quality. Such views align very well with the ADEE commitment to excellence, emphasis on collaboration and consensus making. However, we understand that achieving these ambitions is a long- term plan which requires resources, commitment and shared motivation to reshape existing structures and activities.

Our visiting team strongly believe that FMD USJ is in a good position to achieve their Vision and the Panel express their common understanding that ADEE will support and collaborate with the institution in the steps that are being in realizing current and future projects.

The visitation panel is comfortable to add FDM USJ as being a member of the ADEE LEADER School programme with immediate effect and this registration will remain valid for a period of 3 years once the relevant due are paid by the FDM USJ. We hope that representative of the FMD USJ will be able to join us at ADEE 2023 Liverpool to receive a presentation of the ADEE LEADER plaque.



ADVANCING EDUCATION
AND ORAL HEALTH

Association for Dental Education in Europe

International Office

Dublin Dental University Hospital

Trinity College, Lincoln Place

Dublin 2, Ireland

administrator@adee.org

<http://www.adee.org>

+353 1 612 7235

+353 1 612 7294